




Comparative Study of Learning Outcomes Between Regular Students and Islamic Boarding School Students in Elementary Schools

*Sri Wahyuni¹, Hanif Amrulloh Z.A¹, Nurul Aisyah¹

¹ Universitas Ma'arif Lampung, Indonesia

 ser262425@gmail.com*

Abstract

The purpose of this study was to determine the comparative study of learning outcomes between regular students and students of Islamic boarding schools in grade V at SD NU Metro. This study used a quantitative comparative design approach. The population in this study amounted to 68 students, the sampling technique used was a non-probability purposive sampling technique, so that 15 students who lived in the boarding school and 15 students who did not live in the boarding school were obtained. The data collection technique used questionnaires, interviews, and documentation methods. The results of this study were that there was no significant difference between regular students and Islamic boarding school students, this was evidenced by the homogeneity test where the significance value was $0.335 > 0.05$, and the t-test was $1.005 > 2.042$ and the significance value was $0.000 < 0.05$. Based on the results of the calculations above, a significance value of 0.000 was obtained, which was smaller than the significance level of 5% or 0.05. So H_a was rejected and H_o was accepted, which showed that there was no significant difference between regular students and Islamic boarding school students. The researcher played an important role in presenting quantitative data analysis involving the application of appropriate comparative statistical tests, including the finding that there was no significant difference in learning outcomes between regular students and fifth grade Islamic boarding school students.

Keywords : Comparative Study, Elementary School, Learning Outcomes

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:

Received

May 08, 2024

Revised

May 24, 2024

Accepted

June 20, 2024

Published by

Website

This is an open access article under the CC BY SA license

CV. Creative Pen Monument

<https://attractivejournal.com/index.php/bec>

<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/>



INTRODUCTION

Learning process itself leads to behavioral changes. Behavioral changes that can be observed in students include cognitive, emotional, and psychomotor changes (Tina, 2023). According to Dalyono in the Ahmad Syarifuddin journal, the factors that influence learning outcomes are stated. Internal factors (originating from within oneself), health, Intelligence and talent, interest and motivation, learning methods. External factors (originating from outside oneself), family, school, community, surrounding environment (Sundari, 2024).

Benjamin Samuel Bloom divides learning outcomes into 3 domains, namely cognitive (knowledge), affective (attitude), and psychomotor (skills), which we often know as Bloom's taxonomy (Mahmudi et al., 2022). The cognitive domain is knowledge, understanding, application, analysis, synthesis and evaluation. The affective domain is attitude, receiving, responding, values, organization, character. The psychomotor domain includes productive, technical, physical, managerial, and intellectual skills (Sugiarto, 2023).

Learning outcomes play an important role in the learning process because with these results teachers can find out how the development of experience or knowledge that students have obtained in an effort to achieve their learning goals through the next teaching and learning process (Agusti & Aslam, 2022).

The family environment plays an important role in improving student learning outcomes. The family is an educational institution that plays a major role in the growth and development of children (Utama & Dea, 2023). Although children consider school as the second environment after family, the role of parents remains very important and is responsible for the success of their children's education (Rachmad et al., 2023). This is further strengthened by the increasing trend of learning involving technology, where parents play a central role in supporting and supervising the learning process at home. The important role of parents in children's education is not only limited to supervision, but also includes creating a conducive learning atmosphere at home (Thahir & Hidriyanti, 2017). Meanwhile, many parents choose to entrust their children to Islamic boarding schools (Eka Sari, Noviana Komsu, Al-azhaar Lubuklinggau, Sri Yanti, & Hecksa Manora, 2023). The reason for this choice is so that students not only get formal education at school, but also get religious education (Jaenullah, Ferdian Utama, 2022). One example is SD NU Metro. This elementary school provides formal education, but some of the students also live in Islamic boarding schools located not far from NU Elementary School, such as Darul A'mal, Al-Fadhilah, and Roudhotul Qur'an Islamic boarding schools, although there are religious lessons at NU Metro Elementary School itself.

In 2023, a similar study was conducted with the title "Comparative Study of the Morals of Students Living in the Family Environment and the Islamic Boarding School Environment of MTS Miftahul Ulum Pucang Madiun in the 2022/2023 Academic Year", by Putra Hidayatulloh. This study uses a quantitative method. The results of the study concluded that the null hypothesis (there is no significant difference in morals between students living in a family environment and students living in an Islamic boarding school environment) is accepted or approved. Because it is known that t_{obs} is 0.943; while $t_{table} = 2,000$, then t_{obs} is smaller than t_{table} (Hidayatulloh, 2023). The fundamental difference between this study and the research that I will do lies in the independent variables. If previous studies used student morals as independent variables, this study uses learning outcomes. In addition, there are differences in the year. Research, sampling location, and the research sample itself. However, these two studies have similarities in terms of the approach used, namely a comparative study by comparing two dependent variables.

In 2024 Nur Rahmah Clarisma Sari also conducted a similar study entitled Comparative Study of Islamic Religious Education Learning Outcomes of Class XI Boarding School and Non-Boarding School Students at SMA Islam Plus At-Tholibin Bandar Surabaya "This study also uses a comparative quantitative method. With the learning outcomes of Islamic Religious Education between class XI students at SMA Islam Plus At-Tholibin Bandar Surabaya between students who follow the Boarding School and Non-Boarding School systems. This is reinforced by data analysis using SPSS Version 26, which shows a significance value (Sig) of 0.718, exceeding the value of 0.05. Thus, the null hypothesis (H_0) is accepted, and the alternative hypothesis (H_a) is rejected, indicating that the status variable of Boarding School or Non-Boarding School students does not have a significant effect on student learning outcomes (Pokhrel, 2024). The fundamental difference between this study and the research to be conducted lies in the independent and dependent variables. This study compares the learning outcomes of boarding school and non-boarding school students, while the research to be conducted compares the learning outcomes of regular students and Islamic boarding schools. In addition that, there are differences in the year of research, location, and research sample. However, these two studies have similarities in terms of the approach used, namely a comparative study by comparing two different groups.

Analyzing two previous studies, the researcher is interested in examining the learning outcomes of regular students and students of Islamic boarding schools. Both groups of students with different backgrounds follow the same learning process at school, especially in class V of SD NU Metro, some of whose students live in Islamic boarding schools.

Based on the results of interviews with fifth-grade teachers at NU Elementary School, some fifth-grade students who live in Darul A'mal, Al-Fadhilah, and Roudotul Qur-An Islamic boarding schools have very busy activity schedules, participating in school activities, they are also active in Islamic boarding school activities. Such a heavy burden often makes them look tired. In fact, at elementary school age, children need enough rest time to support their growth and development (Munatul Karimah, 2025). On the other hand, living in an Islamic boarding school provides opportunities for children to study various subjects, not only academic but also religious. Although NU Elementary School already has a Diniyah program, Islamic boarding school students receive more intensive religious learning at the boarding school, so they do not fully participate in the madrasah diniyyah activities at NU Elementary School like regular students (Maria Fitriyanti, 2025).

This study aims to compare learning outcomes between regular students and Islamic boarding school students and whether there are significant differences between the two and what are the factors that support and inhibit the learning outcomes of regular students and Islamic boarding school students. The achievement of this study will provide a significant contribution in developing learning outcomes and supporting factors, especially for fifth grade students of SD NU Metro.

METHOD

This research uses quantitative research methods, According to Sugiyono in the Lontar journal, quantitative research methods are research methods based on the philosophy of positivism, aiming to research certain populations or samples, and data collection is carried out using research instruments, with quantitative or statistical data analysis (Prasanti, 2018). This research is comparative in nature, According to Nazir in Wiwin Putri Zayu Comparative research is a type of descriptive research that seeks to find fundamental answers about cause and effect, by analyzing the factors causing the occurrence or emergence of a particular phenomenon. It is comparative between two or more groups of a particular variable. Comparative studies focus on systematic variables, namely macro variables. This is because the system is more general and broad when compared to other variables (Zayu, Herman, & Vitri, 2023). So this study was written to compare the learning outcomes between regular students and students of Islamic boarding schools So that the differences and better conditions between the two phenomena being compared are known. This study was conducted at SD Nahdatul Ulama, Metro City V. The population in this study was the entire number of fifth grade students of SD Nahdlatul Ulama, Metro City, a total of 68 students, sampling using probability sampling techniques and non-probability sampling where the sample was 15 regular students and 15 Islamic boarding school students.

According to (Sugiyono, 2021) in his data collection techniques can be carried out using various methods, such as observation, interviews, questionnaires, document studies, or a combination of the four. In this study, data collection techniques are divided into 3 types, namely interviews, questionnaires, and documentation. Initial observations were carried out on July 15 to August 31, 2024/2025 at SD NU Metro, interviews were given (to the principal and 3 homeroom teachers of grade V), and a questionnaire consisting of 10 questions was given to students and tested using the validity and reliability formula. The data was then tested using normality and homogeneity tests, and analyzed using the t-sample test hypothesis. To calculate the T test, what needs to be considered is that if the analysis used is simple regression, then the basis for decision making is, if the sig value is <

0.05, then there is a simultaneous influence of variable X on variable Y. Conversely, if the sig value is > 0.05 , then there is no simultaneous influence of variable X on variable Y.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Regular students are students who live in a family environment and reside in a boarding school. Meanwhile, boarding school students are students who live and reside in a boarding school, in addition to participating in school activities, boarding school students also participate in activities at the boarding school. At SD NU Metro itself, regular students and boarding school students are treated fairly, where they both participate in programs provided by the school, including supporting programs such as Islamic boarding schools. However, boarding school students do not fully participate in Islamic boarding school activities because there is already an Islamic boarding school in the boarding school with the same curriculum or lessons, but this does not affect the learning process at school.

In this study, the instrument making was first arranged by the instrument grid. Before the instrument was used, an *Expert Judgment* was first carried out by one of the experts to produce a quality instrument. After that the instrument was distributed to the field to 15 regular students and 15 students of the Islamic boarding school. The description of the study includes validity and reliability tests, normality tests, homogeneity tests and hypothesis tests with the help of SPSS 25 Windows.

Validity test

After the instrument was distributed to the field openly/directly to respondents of 15 regular students and 15 Islamic boarding school students, the results obtained were that all questions were valid with a total of 10 questions.

Reliability test

After the instrument is considered acceptable, it is continued with a reliability test. Based on *the Cronbach's Alpha Test value*, there is a reliability coefficient variable with value of 0.863.

Table 1. Reliability results

Reliability Statistics	
Cronbach's Alpha	N of Items
0.863	35

Based on table 1. Above, *the Reliability Statistics* above can be seen that *the Cronbach's Alpha value* is 0.863 while *the r-table* is 0.374 which means that $r\text{-count} > r\text{-table}$. This shows that 10 statements to measure the learning outcomes of regular students and Islamic boarding school students are stated as *Reliable*.

Normality test

Normality test is a part of statistical science that is used to test whether the data used has a normal distribution or not so that it can be used in parametric statistics. In other words, the normality test is a test used to determine whether the data obtained is in accordance with a certain theoretical distribution (Matondang et al., 2020).

Table 2. Normality test

One-Sample Kolmogorov-Smirnov Test		
		Unstandardized Residual
N		30
Normal Parameters ^{a,b}	Mean	.0000000
	Std. Deviation	6.65514105
Most Extreme Differences	Absolute	0.146
	Positive	0.139
	Negative	-0.146
Test Statistics		0.146
Asymp. Sig. (2-tailed)		0.102 ^c

The criteria are the significance for two sides of the calculation results greater than 0.05 means normally distributed. According to Rochmat if the significance value of the normality test results > 0.05 then the data is normally distributed therefore it can be concluded that the student's test results are normal. Based on table 2. Above *one sample kolmogorov-smirnov test the asymp* value is 0.102 which means > 0.05 then the data is normally distributed therefore it can be concluded that the student's test results are normal.

Homogeneity test

The homogeneity test is used to determine whether several population variants are the same or not. This test is carried out as a prerequisite in the analysis of independent sample t-test and Anova. The underlying assumption in the analysis of variance (Anova) is that the variance of the population is the same. The test of equality of two variances is used to test whether the data distribution is homogeneous or not, namely by comparing the two variances. If two or more data groups have the same variance, then the homogeneity test does not need to be carried out again because the data is considered homogeneous (Usmadi, 2020).

Table 3. Homogeneity test

Test of Homogeneity of Variances					
		Levene Statistics	df1	df2	Sig.
hb	Based on Mean	0.962	1	28	0.335
	Based on Median	0.585	1	28	0.451
	Based on Median and with adjusted df	0.585	1	27,741	0.451
	Based on trimmed mean	0.993	1	28	0.328

Based on table 3. above, the *Test of Homogeneity of Variances* significance value is 0.335 > 0.05, so it is said that the learning outcomes of regular students and Islamic

boarding school students are the same, there is no significant difference. This proves that H_a is rejected and H_o is accepted.

Hypothesis t test

Hypothesis testing is a branch of inferential statistics that is used to test the truth of a statement statistically and draw conclusions about whether the statement is accepted or rejected. Based on the Big Indonesian Dictionary (KBBI) online, a hypothesis is something that is considered true for a reason or an expression of an opinion (proposition, theory, etc.) even though its truth still needs to be proven, or in other words a basic assumption (Maqfiro et al., 2021).

Table 4. t-test

Coefficients ^a						
		Unstandardized		Standard	t	Sig.
		Coefficients		ized		
Model		B	Std. Error	Beta		
1	(Constant)	-18,984	49,535		-.383	.704
	X	.038	.037	.187	1.005	.323

a. Dependent Variable: Y

Based on table 4. Above, the *t-count value* is 1.005 and the *t-table* is 2.042. So the *t-count* < *t-table* is 1.005 < 2.042 and the significance value is 0.000 < 0.05. Based on the calculation results above, the significance value of 0.000 is smaller than the significance level value of 5% or 0.05.

So it can be concluded that internal factors (which come from within oneself) are health, intelligence and talent, interests and motivation, learning methods and external factors (which come from outside oneself) such as family, school, community, and the surrounding environment greatly affect learning outcomes. Because all are related to getting good learning outcomes, all of these components must be interrelated and work together. Although students at Islamic boarding schools are not always accompanied by their parents, but the ustad and ustazah and the administrators of the boarding school who help in the learning process. Although not fully participating in Islamic boarding school activities at school, students at Islamic boarding schools also have intensive learning activities at Islamic boarding schools with a schedule of activities that have been determined by the relevant Islamic boarding school.

Based on the results above, it has been proven that there is no significant difference between the learning outcomes of students who live in Islamic boarding schools and students who do not live in Islamic boarding schools of grade V SD NU Metro. Thus, the alternative hypothesis (H_a) which states "There is no difference in learning outcomes between regular students and students who do not live in Islamic boarding schools" is rejected. And the null hypothesis (H_o) which states "there is a difference in learning achievement of aqidah akhlak between students who live in Islamic boarding schools and students who do not live in Islamic boarding schools" is accepted.



Figure 1. Interview with class teacher Va



Figure 2. Interview with class teacher Vb



Figure 3. Interview with the principal



Figure 4. Students filling out the questionnaire

CONCLUSION

Based on the results of the study on the comparative study of learning outcomes between regular students and fifth grade Islamic boarding school students at SD NU Metro, learning outcomes are changes in knowledge, skills, attitudes, or values obtained by students after going through the learning process. These results can be measured and evaluated through various methods, such as tests, assignments, observations, and portfolios. Good learning outcomes indicate that students have succeeded in achieving the set learning objectives. Based on the results of the Independent Sample t-test calculation that has been carried out with the help of the SPSS For Windows Version program, the t-count value is 1.005 and the t-table is 2.042. So the t-count < t-table is $1.005 < 2.042$ and the significance value is $0.000 < 0.05$. Based on the results of the calculations above, a significance value of 0.000 is obtained, which is smaller than the significance level value of 5% or 0.05. H_0 is rejected and H_a is accepted, so there is no significant difference between regular students and Islamic boarding school students.

REFERENCES

- Agusti, N. M., & Aslam. (2022). Efektivitas Media Pembelajaran Aplikasi Wordwall Terhadap Hasil Belajar IPA Siswa Sekolah Dasar. *JURNAL BASICEDU*, 6(4).
- Eka Sari, M., Noviana Komsu, D., Al-azhaar Lubuklinggau, I., Sri Yanti, I., & Hecksa Manora, I. (2023). The Role of Family Education in Improving Religion and Moral Values in Early Childhood. *Journal of Childhood Development*, 3(2), 89–97. <http://doi.org/10.25217/JCD.V3I2.3871>
- Hidayatulloh, P. (2023). *Studi Komparasi Akhlak Siswa Yang Tinggal Di Lingkungan Keluarga Dan Lingkungan Pesantren MTS Miftahul Ulum Pucang Madiun Tahun Ajaran 2022/2023*. Institut Agama Islam Negeri Ponorogo.
- Jaenullah, Ferdian Utama, D. S. (2022). Resilience Model of the Traditional Islamic Boarding School Education System in Shaping the Morals of Student in the Midst of Modernizing Education. *Jurnal Kependidikan: Jurnal Hasil Penelitian Dan Kajian Kepustakaan Di Bidang Pendidikan, Pengajaran Dan Pembelajaran*, 8(4), 931–942. <http://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.33394/jk.v8i4.6013>
- Mahmudi, I., Athoillah, M. Z., Wicaksono, E. B., & Kusuma, A. R. (2022). Taksonomi Hasil Belajar Menurut Benyamin S. Bloom. *Jurnal Multidisiplin Madani (MADANI)*, 2(9). Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.55927/mudima.v2i9.1132>
- Maqfiro, S. N. A., Fajrin, I., & Sukmah, A. (2021). 3 1,2,3. *Jurnal Kreativitas Pengabdian Kepada Masyarakat (Pkm)*, 4(2), 307–316.
- Matondang, M., Rini, M. S., Putri, E. F., Yolviansyah, N. D., & Fauziah. (2020). Uji Perbandingan Motivasi Belajar Siswa Kelas XI MIPA 2 Dan XII MIPA 2 Di SMA Negeri 1 Muaro Jambi. *Jurnal Sains Dan Pendidikan Fisika*, 16(03).

- Pokhrel, S. (2024). No TitleEAENH. *Αγαη*, 15(1), 37–48.
- Prasanti, D. (2018). Penggunaan Media Komunikasi Bagi Remaja Perempuan Dalam Pencarian Informasi Kesehatan. *Jurnal Lontar*, 6(1), 13–21.
- Rachmad, Y. E., Agnesiana, B., Agama, I., Ambon, K. N., Sukmawati, E., Ramli, A., ... Zebua, Y. (2023). The Analysis of Parenting Patterns in Instilling Morals of Early Childhood. *Journal of Childhood Development*, 3(1), 13–21. <http://doi.org/10.25217/JCD.V3I1.3247>
- Sugiarto. (2023). IQ Intelligence Level Analysis of Prospective Elementary School Students as a Condition for Readiness to Learn at School. *Journal of Childhood Development*, 3(2), 98–108. <http://doi.org/10.25217/JCD.V3I2.3873>
- Sugiyono. (2021). Metode Penelitian Pendidikan (Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, dan R&D, dan Penelitian Pendidikan). *Alfabeta*.
- Sundari, E. (2024). Cendikia pendidikan. *Cendekia Pendidikan*, 4(4), 50–54. <http://doi.org/10.9644/sindoro.v3i9.252>
- Thahir, A., & Hidriyanti, B. (2017). Pengaruh Bimbingan Belajar Terhadap Prestasi Belajar Siswa Pondok Pesantren Madrasah Aliyah Al-Utruiyyah Kota Karang Bandar Lampung. *KONSELI: Jurnal Bimbingan Dan Konseling (E-Journal)*, 1(2), 55–66. <http://doi.org/10.24042/kons.v1i2.306>
- Tina, R. (2023). Analisis Pelaksanaan Bimbingan Belajar Terhadap Pemahaman Gaya Belajar Peserta Didik Smp Pelita Cabang Empat Kecamatan Abung Selatan.
- Usmadi. (2020). Pengujian Persyaratan Analisis (Uji Homogenitas Dan Uji Hipotesis). *Inovasi Pendidikan*, 7(1), 50–62.
- Utama, F., & Dea, L. F. (2023). Alternative Early Childhood Moral Development: Parenting through the Local Wisdom of Lampung People. *Journal of Childhood Development*, 3(2), 180–187. <http://doi.org/10.25217/JCD.V3I2.3302>
- Zayu, W. P., Herman, H., & Vitri, G. (2023). Studi Komparatif Pelaksanaan Tugas Besar Perencanaan Geometrik Jalan Secara Daring Dan Luring. *Jurnal Hasil Penelitian Dan Pengkajian Ilmiah Eksakta*, 2(1), 92–96. <http://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.47233/jppie.v2i1.762>

Copyright Holder :

© Sri Wahyuni, et.al., (2024).

First Publication Right :

© Bulletin of Early Childhood

This article is under:

CC BY SA